



ADMINISTRATIVE CONFIDENTIAL

DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH & HUMAN SERVICES

Public Health Service  
National Institutes of Health

## Memorandum

Date August 19, 1985  
From Associate Director, NCI  
Subject Science Manuscript Review Process  
To TO THE RECORD

Over the weekend, we had several conversations with Dr. R. Gallo regarding the accessibility of documents dealing with the review process of the Barre-Sinoussi *et al.*, Science, May 1983 manuscript. Dr. Gallo talked previously with Ms. Ruth Kulstad, Senior Editor who mentioned that negative input had been received by Science relative to the above manuscript. According to Dr. Gallo, it was his strong positive input that was helpful in getting the paper published, and that there was additional negative input on the manuscript. We felt that if the content of the other reviewer(s) comments were made available (without the reviewer's name) it may shed more light on the events at that time. Parenthetically, some journals will reciprocally and anonymously exchange the comments of the reviewers.

Since Ms. R. Kulstead could not be reached, we talked to Ms. Patricia A. Morgan, Managing Editor of Science. We asked whether the comments of the other reviewer(s) could be obtained. She emphatically and categorically stated that this is specifically not possible and that only generic statements on the review policy are available. We said that we will review the documents in our possession, i.e., comments by Dr. Gallo as reviewer, as well as comments by Dr. Gallo's collaborators who had seen the manuscript prior to publication. Should we require additional information relative to the potential legal case being developed, the Department will make a direct formal request to Dr. D. Koshland, Editor of Science.

  
Peter J. Fischinger, M.D., Ph.D.